

Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto



**CANADIAN MIGRATION LAW AND POLICY**  
**Volume II**

**Prof. Audrey Macklin**

**Law 456H1F**

**Fall 2005**

**Draft Materials edited by E. Carasco, S. Aiken, D.  
Galloway and A. Macklin, with W. Creates**

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 29 2005

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# Canadian Immigration and Refugee Law – Volume 2

## Table of Contents

### CHAPTER SIX – THE ECONOMIC CLASS

Introduction .....	6-1
General Requirements .....	2
Lock-In Date .....	3
Retroactivity .....	4
<i>Borisova v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> .....	4
<i>Dragan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> .....	5
<i>Kazi v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> .....	5
A. Skilled Worker Class	
1. Definition .....	5
Christopher Worswick, “Immigrants’ Declining Earnings: Reasons and Remedies” (2004) .....	6
2. National Occupation Classification Matrix .....	12
<i>Nehme v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> .....	15
3. Pass Mark .....	19
4. Selection Criteria	
1. General .....	21
Martin Collacott (2003) .....	22
Erin Tolley (2003) .....	28
i. Education .....	36

ii.	Language.....	43
iii.	Experience .....	45
	<i>Dogra v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> .....	47
	Andrew Brouwer (1999), "Immigrants Need not Apply", Caledon Institute of Social Policy, 1999 .....	52
E.	Age .....	61
F.	Arranged Employment .....	61
G.	Adaptability .....	61
5.	Discretion .....	62
	<i>Chen v. Canada</i> [1994] .....	63
6.	Provincial and Territorial Nominee Class .....	69
B.	Alberta .....	70
C.	Prince Edward Island .....	71
D.	British Columbia .....	71
B.	The Business Classes .....	72
1.	Entrepreneurs .....	72
	David Ley, "Seeking Homo Economicus: The Strange Story of Canada's Business Immigration Program", May 2000 .....	74
D.	Documentation of Funds .....	95
E.	Delegation of Authority .....	95
2.	Investors .....	95
A.	General .....	95
B.	Qualifications .....	95
C.	Source of Funds.....	95
3.	Self-Employed Persons .....	96

A.	General .....	96
B.	Qualifications .....	97
4.	Selection Criteria for Business Immigrants .....	97
5.	Substituted Evaluation .....	97
IV.	Live-In Caregiver Class .....	98
VI.	Discussion Questions .....	6-100

## CHAPTER SEVEN – THE FAMILY CLASS

### Introduction

A.	Who is Family? .....	7-2
1.	Spouses/Common-Law Partners/Conjugal Partners .....	2
	<i>Minister of Employment and Immigration</i> <i>v. Resham Kaur Taggar</i> .....	4
	<i>Canada (Minister of Employment and</i> <i>Immigration) v. Narwal</i> .....	7
	<i>Bhatti v Canada [2004]</i> .....	10
	<i>Macapagal v. Canada [2004]</i> .....	13
	“Adalah petitions” (2003) .....	19
a.	Same Sex Relationships .....	20
b.	Polygamous Relationships .....	22
c.	“Immigration Marriages” .....	24
	<i>Horbas v. Minister of Employment</i> <i>and Immigration</i> .....	26
	<i>Salh v. Canada (Minister of Employment</i> <i>and Immigration)</i> .....	28
2.	Children .....	32
	<i>De Guzman v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration 2004</i> .....	33
a.	Adopted Children .....	43

Adoption and Sponsorship: Characteristics of <i>Bona Fide</i> Foreign Adoptions .....	43
<i>Cheema (Litigation Guardian) v. Canada</i> (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) .....	46
<i>Frounze v. Canada</i> .....	52
Questions .....	57
<b>B. Sponsorship</b>	
1. General Requirements .....	57
Audrey Macklin, “Public Entrance/Private Member” .....	59
<i>Fortaleza v. Canada</i> [2005] .....	64
2. Women sponsored by husbands/partners .....	68
Colleen Sheppard, “Women as Wives: Immigration Law and Domestic Violence” .....	68
3. Sponsored Immigrants and Social Assistance .....	76
Michael Trebilcock, “The Law and Economics of Immigration Policy” .....	76
<b>RETHINKING IMMIGRATION POLICIES</b>	
A. Independent Applicants .....	76
B. Family Preference Immigration .....	79
The mandatory insurance proposal in context .....	79
Questions .....	7- 81

## CHAPTER EIGHT – REFUGEES: THE INTERNATIONAL CONTEXT

<b>A. Introduction</b>	
1. Facts and Figures .....	8-1
Tables	

1.	Persons of Concern to the UNHCR 2003 .....	2
2.	Refugee Claims Filed 1994-2002 Canada and Other Refugee - Receiving Countries .....	3
2.	Religious and Ethical Origins of the Concept of Asylum .....	4
	Karen Musalo, Jennifer Moore & Richard Boswell, <i>Refugee Law and Policy: Cases and Materials</i> .....	4
B.	History Leading Up to the Refugee Convention .....	10
	L. Barnett, "Global Governance and the Evolution of the International Convention" .....	10
	1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees .....	12
	"Convention Refugee Definition" – James Hathaway Excerpt .....	12
	OAU Definition .....	15
C.	The <i>Non-Refoulement</i> Obligation .....	15
1.	The History and Development of Non-refoulement .....	15
	Dent and Hathaway, <i>Refugee Rights</i> .....	16
2.	Non Entrée Mechanisms	
	Amnesty International Canada .....	21
	Joanne Van Selm, "Access to Procedures" .....	22
	Stephen Knight , "Defining Due Process Down" .....	27
	"Canada/US Safe Third Country Agreement" .....	32
D.	Beyond the Convention Definition	
1.	Migratory Movements	
	Michael Oliver, <i>The Movement of Peoples: A View from the South</i> .....	33
2.	Globalization and International Migration	



	Helene Pellerin, “Global Restructuring in the World Economy and Migration” .....	34
3.	Gender Persecution	
	Judith Kumin, “Gender Persecution in the Spotlight” .....	38
E.	Role of the UNHCR.....	40
	Tim Wichert, “Pursuing Social Policy Ideals at the International Level” .....	41
	Michael Barnett, “Humanitarianism With a Sovereign Face” .....	44
F.	Canada and Refugees.....	47
	Canadian Council for Refugees, “Refugees Worldwide” .....	49
	CCR, “State of Refugees in Canada” .....	52
	Rousseau et al., “The complexity of Determining Refugeehood: .... (2002) .....	54
	Sharryn Aiken, “Of Gods and Monsters” .....	60
	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, <i>Report on the Situation of Human Rights of Asylum Seekers within the Canadian Refugee Determination System</i> .....	64
	Diane Francis, <i>Immigration: The Economic Case</i> .....	70
G.	Peering Into The Future	
	UNHCR, “A Timeless Treaty Under Attack: Reconsidering the Convention” .....	75
	Jeff Crisp, “A New Asylum Paradigm” .....	77
	Richard Black, “Putting Refugees in Camps” .....	80
	Questions .....	8-84

## CHAPTER NINE – THE CANADIAN INTERPRETATION OF THE REFUGEE DEFINITION

A.	Introduction .....	9-1
B.	Eligibility to Make a Protection Claim .....	3



C.	Chart of Refugee Protection Determination Process .....	5
D.	The Refugee Protection Hearing .....	6
E.	Elements of the Refugee Definition.....	7
1.	The refugee claimant must be outside his/her national state/place of habitual residence .....	7
2.	The refugee claimant must have a fear of persecution .....	9
a.	Interpretation of Persecution .....	9
	Deborah Anker, “Refugee Law, Gender and the Human Rights Paradigm” .....	11
b.	Persecution and Discrimination.....	13
c.	Persecution and Prosecution.....	13
d.	Persecution that is Cumulative .....	15
e.	Persecution in the Context of Civil War .....	16
f.	Agents of Persecution .....	18
	<i>Canada v. Ward</i> [1993] .....	18
	ECRE, “Position on the Interpretation of Art. 1” .....	25
g.	Gender-Based Persecution .....	25
	Chantal Tie, “Sex, Gender, and Refugee Protection in Canada under Bill C-11” .....	27
3.	Well-Founded Fear .....	36
4.	Grounds of Persecution .....	38
a.	Race .....	39
b.	Nationality .....	39
c.	Religion .....	40
d.	Membership in a Particular Social Group .....	42
	<i>Ward</i> Excerpt .....	43

	Comment on <i>Ward</i> by Alexander Aleinikoff .....	48
e.	Political Opinion .....	50
	Ward Excerpt .....	51
5.	Unable or Unwilling to Avail him/herself of national State's Protection .....	55
	Ward Excerpt .....	55
	a. Internal Flight Alternative.....	57
F.	Exclusion Clauses .....	60
	1. Article 1E .....	60
	2. Article 1F .....	61
	UNHCR, Application of the Exclusion Clauses (2003) .....	62
	3. Procedural Issues	
	James Sloan, "The Application of Article 1F" (2000) .....	65
	<i>Pushpanathan v. Canada</i> [1998] .....	70
G.	Cessation Clauses .....	75
H.	Consolidated Grounds .....	77
	<i>Li v. Canada</i> [2005] .....	77
	Questions .....	9-90

## CHAPTER TEN – SOVEREIGNTY AND BORDER CONTROL

A.	Introduction .....	10-1
B.	The Enforcement Context	
1.	Immigration Enforcement, Sovereignty and Refugee Determination.....	2
	Reg Whitaker, "Refugees: The Security Dimension" .....	2
	Sharryn Aiken, "Of Gods and Monsters" .....	21

2.	Immigration Enforcement and International Relations .....	27
3.	Immigration Enforcement, Security and the United States .....	27
	“The Canada-U.S. Smart Border Declaration” (from Department of Foreign Affairs webpage) .....	27
	“Canada’s Actions Against Terrorism Since September 11” (Department of Foreign Affairs) .....	29
	Notes .....	35
4.	Organized Crime, Human Trafficking and People Smuggling	
	Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons.....	36
	Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air .....	41
	Questions .....	10-47

## CHAPTER ELEVEN – ENFORCEMENT

I.	Inadmissibility and Removal	
A.	Determining Inadmissibility .....	11-1
1.	Criteria of Inadmissibility .....	2
a.	Health Grounds.....	2
	<i>Deol v. Canada</i> , [2003] 1 FC 301 (CA) .....	3
	Note on Excessive Demand.....	7
	Lisa Priest, “HIV Test Used to Bar Potential Immigrants” .....	8
	Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network, “Is Mandatory HIV Testing of Immigrants and Refugees Justified?” .....	9
b.	Criminality .....	13
	<i>Li v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> , [1997] 1 FC 235 (CA) .....	13

	<i>Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) v. Saini</i> , [2002] 1 FC 200 .....	19
	Note on Rehabilitation .....	27
c.	Organized Criminality .....	27
	<i>Chiau v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> , [2001] 2 FC 297 (CA) .....	27
	Notes .....	34
d.	Security .....	35
e.	Other Grounds of Inadmissibility .....	35
C.	Removal Orders	
1.	Types of Order .....	36
2.	Stays of Removal Orders .....	37
3.	Pre-Removal Risk Assessment (PRRA) .....	37
	Questions .....	37
II.	Security Certificates, Danger Opinions, Withholding Evidence and Detention	
A.	Security Certificates and Danger Opinions .....	40
1.	Security Certificates .....	40
B.	Danger Opinions .....	41
1.	Eligibility .....	41
2.	Refoulement .....	41
	<i>Suresh v. Canada</i> .....	41
	Colin Freeze, "Powerful Antiterror Tool Rarely Employed by Ottawa" .....	57
	"How Nations deal with foreign terrorist suspects" (2004) .....	58

B.	Withholding Evidence .....	60
	<i>Sogi v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> , [2003] FCJ no. 1836.....	60
C.	Detention .....	63
	<i>Almrei v. Canada</i> [2004] .....	64
	Notes .....	73
	CCR Brief on Bill C-11 (extract) .....	73
	IRB Chairperson's Guidelines on Detention .....	74
	IACHR Report on Canada (2000).....	79
	<i>Canada v. Zhang</i> [2001] 4 FC 173 .....	88
	Questions .....	11-91



7